## **Design Assessment Form**

Diploma Apprentice's Name	Mark D'Cruz	
Project Title	July 4th 2023	
Design Number	1 of 10	
Date Design Started	December 2023	
Date Design Completed	3rd April 2024	
Has the Design been implemented?	It is being implemented, both directly and through its influence on several other designs in the apprentice's portfolio	
Online Link to Design (if available)	https://www.vila-pinheiro.com/diploma-journey	
Type of Design (delete all that don't apply)	Non Land Based	
Design Category (delete all that don't apply, more than one could apply)	Education & Culture / Health & Spiritual Well Being / Finances & Economics / Land Tenure & Community Governance / Land & Nature Stewardship /	
Name of Personal Tutor	Tom Henfrey	
Ready for Presentation	Yes Ready	
Name & Signature of Assessing Tutor	Tom Henfrey T. Harfrey	
Date of Assessment	April 17th 2024	
Date Apprentice started Diploma	July 4th 2023	

If this design is include	ed in the FPA2 sample assessed by a Senior Tutor:
Comments from Senior	
Tutor	
Name, Date & Signature of Senior Tutor	

		What's gone well?	What could have been done differently?
1a	The design uses an appropriate design framework or intentional process accurately (e.g does the design visit every step of the process)	The Design Web is employed, and the choice justified in a reflective piece that highlights the particular relevance of a flexible design process for this design. The design visits all twelve anchor points.	The wonderfully organic nature of this design generates many potential intersections and crossovers among different anchor points. This could have been explored more fully, taking advantage of the flexibility of the design web and the possibility of moving from any anchor point to any other and at any time, visiting some on multiple occasions and in different sequences and combinations.
1b	It utilises the permaculture ethics appropriately	The design makes regular reference to the permaculture ethics, individually and as a group, particularly in a focussed examination of the relevance of each ethic at the Principles anchor point. In the same section, the account of the Ma Ke Bonsai way tenets and principles brings the permaculture ethics in at various points.	More attention to the intersections between the ethics, and among all three: in what ways do they challenge and complement each other in this design, and are there ways to promote greater synergy?
1c	The design uses permaculture principles & theory that are appropriate	The twelve Holmgren principles are thoroughly explored, in particular as key ingredients of the Ma Ke Bonsai Way tenets and principles.	The design is a great example of both Edge (the creative encounter between permaculture and bonsai) and Stacking (the emergence at this edge

	to the situation	Excellent idea to use permaculture ethics and principles in order to develop specific principles for your bonsai culture.	of new layers of complexity that hold new potential). Explicit attention to both concepts could be valuable in the implementation and ongoing development of this design.
1d	It uses a <b>variety of tools</b> to suit the needs of the situation / design brief	Numerous and appropriate design tools are employed, accurately and productively: SMARTER Goals, SWIC, Pattern Language, 6 Thinking Hats, Design Plan, Implementation and Maintenance plans, PMI.	
1e	The design is intelligible, coherent and effective, meeting the client's needs	The design creates a new integrative philosophy that combines permaculture and bonsai, leading to a coherent set of strategic goals and a clear action plan towards achieving them.  This design is clearly part of an integrated approach to your life and livelihood, which would be worth sharing elsewhere – maybe in your learning pathway or summary of relevant activities.	At some point in this design, a brief review of the MKBW#1 would have been useful, as this design clearly builds on experiences from its earlier iteration.  I am not sure how 'my homestead' and 'inner journey' designs connect with this design. I would recommend explaining this in a separate document (your learning pathway?) as this design is already very full. This can then be cross-referenced in here if desired.
1f	The documentation is appropriate to present to the clients and others	The design is excellently presented and clearly structured, including an opening summary and table of contents. Appropriate use of figures and inclusion of illustrative photos break the text up nicely.	For uninformed readers (like me or and FPA2 tutor) a couple of paragraphs of context at the beginning would be helpful, maybe with a link. What does Ma-Ke stand for? If it has a specific and relevant meaning this would be useful to spell out. The two-tiered page numbering confused me initially.

Please fill in Section 2.1 or 2.2. Section 2.1 is more suitable for design processes such as SADIM, OBREDIM, CEAP whereas Section 2.2 is specifically for Design Web designs

Section 2.2: Applying Pe (For Designs using the D		
	What's gone well?	What could have been done differently?

Vision What qualities did the vision have? Was it specific, grounded, ambitious?	The vision is ambitious in scope, and clearly laid out in relation to three key lines of activity (teaching, homesteading and inner life), all of which are to be explored in the apprentice's design portfolio. It is further articulated as a clear and compelling mission statement and grounded in three SMARTER goals, which are described in some detail and show clear and realistic pathways towards achieving the goals.  Clear Vision, Mission and Goals laid out on p3. Holistic and ambitious. Good to see the context of the 3 strands here. SMARTER goals can later be evaluated.	For the final version, you could specify which designs in your portfolio fit within each of your three key lines of work.
Limits How were the limits paid attention to in the design? Did they become functions of the design?	Important limits are clearly identified in the Concerns section of a SWIC analysis, and translated into key needs that become functions of the design.	
Helps Were external and internal resources identified? Were the designers motivation's explained?	Helps are considered within the context of a SWIC analysis. 'Strengths' highlights various intangible resources, or cultural qualities, while Wishes and Interests more deeply explore the ambitions of the programme and designer's motivations.	It would be useful to have some sort of resource assessment - particularly an account of tangible and intangible resources available from the previous version of the programme on which the design builds.
Patterns What patterns were used in the design?	The design includes a concise pattern language for bonsai cultivation, comprising 16 patterns derived from existing bonsai practice.  Great list of widely applicable patterns, structured around the process and clearly grounded in permaculture theory and practice.	You might find it interesting to compare these patterns, in tone as well as detail, with the forest garden pattern language in Dave Jacke's book Edible Forest Gardens, volume 2.  A key feature of Jacke's and Alexander's pattern languages is to point out the interconnectedness of the individual patterns and make explicit links across to other patterns. I wonder if this is possible here?
Ideas	Ideas are gathered early in the design, organised	It's not clear to what degree ideas are relevant to

How well were ideas gathered and used? Do you have any ideas to add to the design?	into four clear categories at varying degrees of realism.  Helpful to have the early ideas grouped according to feasibility and realism, and highlight how permaculture can be infused into bonsai growing	the established goals, nor whether and how they are applied later in the design. A summary of key needs or other relevant outcomes from this anchor point could be helpful.
Principles What principles were used in the design? How were they used?	At the heart of the design is a description of the six tenets and twelve principles that define Ma Ke Bonsai Way 2.0, derived from the design, followed by a lengthy and comprehensive exploration of the relationships of these tenets and principles to the permaculture ethics and Holmgren principles.	Wonderful stuff! I'd be intrigued to see any parallels you would draw with any of Mollison's 'attitudinal principles' (as Rosemary Morrow describes them). I am not entirely sure what the difference between the tenets and principles is, and why they are two distinct sets.  The overlay of ethics/ principles/tenets is quite elaborate and there is a lot of overlap. While this is useful at this point of the learning journey, in future designs consider whether you can focus on a small number of key principles to achieve a succinct and effective design.
Integration Were the key needs / purpose / functions clearly identified? Did the design feel cohesive? How did it bring together information from the other anchor points?  Action How are the plans laid out? How realistic do they seem?	A brief 'design plan' coheres the design around three key goals and the overall strategies or approaches that will be employed to reach them. A Six Thinking Hats analysis expands on this, synthesising insights from previous anchor points and showing how they translate into ideas and strategies for action.  A four-stage action plan lays out a series of key action steps, along with a timeline for their completion.  Actions are stated in quite a general sense (each stage in the action plan could be a design in itself - and possibly is), and implied to build on and further develop existing connections with the	More explicit flagging of key needs and their sources in previous anchor points would help make the design even more cohesive.  I'm not entirely sure how the Goals in the design plan section relate to the earlier SMARTER goals. Is there a reason why there are two sets of goals in this design?  It would be useful to see, in a later version of this design submitted to the FPA1, an account of progress to date, any tweaks to the action plan and timeline, and results of the impact assessment planned at stage four.
Momentum What was used to keep momentum, or fulfil ongoing	bonsai community.  The design identifies broad range of strategies for sustaining momentum, at different levels: project management, personal routines, community-	To what extent are these actions maintenance, and to what extent are they goals and intended outcomes of the design itself? It would be

'maintenance' needs?	building, evaluation and learning mechanisms, attention to intrinsic motivations, and ongoing innovation.	interesting to consider this in relation to the 'holy grail' of permaculture design, a total equivalence of harvesting and maintenance.  I agree that a plan for feedback and reviews is crucial to the further evolution of this design.  (pointed out on p26). Dos such a plan exist and can it be shared or linked here?
Appreciation  How were rituals of appreciation incorporated into the design?  Reflection (within the design)	Focussed accounts of appreciation to community, nature and personal history reflect the extent to which appreciative practice is deeply and thoroughly woven in to this entire design, as also demonstrated by the tenets and principles of the Ma Ke bonsai way as described at the Integration and Principles anchor points.  An opening reflection describes the background	A 'project team' is first mentioned in Appreciation (p31). Up to now I have assumed this was your individual design. Given that there is a team, it would be useful to know how they were involved in developing and implementing the design. This could be part of a paragraph of context at the beginning, introducing the 'story so far'.  At certain points, I would have liked to see more
How has the current situation been reflected upon?	to the design in the apprentice's life history and journey of several decades as a bonsai practitioner, along with the observations that led him to explore permaculture as a methodology for enhancing sustainability.  Several other anchor points highlight the need for ongoing monitoring and evaluation, and describe strategies to achieve this, both self-evaluatory and gathering feedback from the wider impacted community.	detail and specificity concerning the reflection and feedback methods to be employed, and mechanisms for acting upon them.
Pause How did the ideas for pause enhance the design / meet any of the functions?	Several strategies for productive and regenerative uses of pauses are described, along with considerations of how they contribute to meeting the goals and objectives of the design.  An unusual interpretation of this anchor point as a design prompt, rather that a moment of pause by the designer in the process. This works well for me!	This could be more fully integrated, with explicit signposting of connections with other anchor points.

		What's gone well?	What could have been done differently?
3a	The design report includes an evaluation of the design's effectiveness.	PMI is used to evaluate progress so far, including passing reference to the design tools used.	More attention to the tools and design processes employed: how effective they were, with hindsight, and what might have been done differently. (TR: This is part of your Reflections) In future designs, I recommend you (also) explicitly refer to the goals set out earlier in the design in your evaluation. Have they been achieved, and have you modified them in any way as a result of implementation? (In this case, which set of goals would you choose?)
3b	There is a <b>critical reflection</b> on what you have learnt about the design processes, tools, ethics, principles and theory that you have used.	A Reflection section highlights key learnings in several areas, including conceptual, technical and social dimensions of the design process.	
3c	The design shows how design skills and competence have progressed and some next steps for design practice.	A final Moving Forward section describes how this design is effectively a philosophical foundation for the entire diploma, and hence context for the apprentice's design practice.	Some indication of specific ways in which design practice has developed and how learnings will be applied in future designs.

Section 4: The Next Steps	
What are the apprentice's <b>next</b>	Consider adding an update on progress, including any ways in which the design is tweaked, at the
steps with this design, towards	FPA1 stage.

its accreditation.	
What other <b>general or specific issues</b> might help with the apprentice's next steps, eg. to take into future designs.	You have here a unique set of tenets and principles that emerge from your unique combination of permaculture design and bonsai cultivation. I look forward to seeing how they evolve through their application in subsequent designs, and in particular through the different approaches to learning with, from and as nature and how they interweave.
Any other comments about the <b>format</b> of the project presentation,	
The highlight of this design for me is	Weaving together two complementary bodies of thought and practice, and in doing so creating something new and unique, thoughtfully captured in the tenets and principles of the Ma Ke Bonsai Way 2.0.
	It's a great design, pointing out and developing complementarity of traditional and new nature based practices, and developing an offer for practitioners to integrate permaculture.

Space for any other notes and comments to the	apprentice	